

## A Study of the Cultural Grounds in Formation and Growth of Ethnic Challenges in Azerbaijan, Iran

Mansour Salehi<sup>1</sup>, Bahram Navazeni<sup>2</sup>, Masoud Jafarinezhad<sup>3</sup>

This study has been conducted with the aim of finding the cultural bases of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan and tried to provide the desired solutions for managing ethnic diversity in Iran and proper policy making in order to respect the components and the culture of the people towards increasing national solidarity. In this regard, this study investigates the cultural grounds of the formation and growth of ethnic challenges created and will be created after the Constitutional Revolution in Azerbaijan, Iran. Accordingly, the main question is that what is the most influential cultural ground in formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan? Research method was the in-depth interview, which was followed by an interview with 32 related experts, and after accessing all the results obtained, analysis of interview data and quotative analysis performed with in-depth interview. Findings of the research indicate that emphasis on the language of a country, cultural discrimination, and the non-implementation of Article 15 of the Constitution for the abandonment of Turkish speakers with 39% were the most important domestic cultural ground, and the impact of satellite channels in Turkey and Republic of Azerbaijan with 32% and superior Turkish identity in the vicinity of Azerbaijan with 31%, were the most important external grounds in formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan in Iran.

*Keywords:* Setting and Ground, Formation and Growth of Ethnic Challenges, Azerbaijani Iran, Ethnicity, National Solidarity.

### Introduction

With the spread of ethnic conflicts and increasing its importance in international politics after the collapse of the Soviet Union in the 1990s, and at the beginning of the 21st century, we witnessed increasing interest to the issue of ethnicity and nationalism in different branches of the social sciences. In the meantime, the Middle East, with various religious and linguistic divisions, attracted the attention of many ethnicity and nationalism researchers. Throughout the history, most of the Middle East countries experienced invasive attacks, colonization, and immigration. Inevitably, they have many ethnic groups and their territorial boundaries are based on such a basis. In this area, ethnicity and minority rights is linked with the themes of the nation state, nationalism, mass governance, nationality, and the rights of many ethnic groups and minorities such as the Kurds in Iraq and Turkey, Shiites in Saudi Arabia, Egyptian in Egypt. Armenians in Lebanon and Syria, Jews in Yemen have always been violently violated. As Asman and Robinovich have stated; "Today, the issue of ethnic conflict describes Middle Eastern politics more than the issues raised in scientific writings" (Edwards, 2003, p. 218).

Since ancient times, Iran has always been a country of a people with diverse cultures, living practices, religion and languages. The presence of different ethnicities such as Persians, Turks, Kurds, Baluchs, Turkmens, Arabs, and Lurs and living together and within the framework of a single political geography represents the ethnic cultural diversity of Iranian society. Each of these ethnic groups had their contribution in maturity, persistence and continuity of Iranian civilization and have been able to maintain the political life of this country in various methods and in spite of many ups and downs (Maghsoodi, 2002).

Therefore, with a complex combination of ethnicities and religions and their linguistic and cultural groups, Iran as a semi-modern semi-traditional society or a country in transition, on the one hand, is faced with ethnic, cultural, and regional gaps in the traditional society and, on the other hand, witnesses the gaps in the modern society (Bashirieh, 2015). The study of political and social history and the developments took place in this country reveals that relations between nations and governments, especially in the history of contemporary Iran, had many fluctuations and ups and downs (Salehi Amiri, 2009).

Ethnic and national identity results from a variety of collective identities and means feeling emotional solidarity and loyalty with a large ethnic and national community. Although ethnic identity has a historical background, but "national identity" is born in new age and it first came to Europe and then

<sup>1</sup>. Ph.D. student at Department of Political Sciences in Shahreza Branch, Islamic Azad University, Iran, mansor.salehi@yahoo.com

<sup>2</sup>. Associate Professor of Faculty of Political Science in Imam Khomeini International University of Qazvin: info@navazeni.ir

<sup>3</sup>. Assistant Professor of Faculty of Political Science in Shahreza Azad University: pegah220ja@yahoo.com

reached the East since the late nineteenth century (Ashraf, 2004). Andrew Haywood knows ethnicity, compared to the nation, as a phenomenon qualified for a sense of loyalty to the people or a specific cultural group (Haywood, 2004). From Smith's (2012) point of view, "The nation has features that the ethnic group lacks, including, the designated land, popular culture, economic unity and rights and duties for everyone, and this makes nations totally different from the ethnic group" (p. 372). According to Walker Conner, The dominant tendency among social scientists is that they define nation and ethnic group based on obvious manifestations such as common language, religion, land, etc. and pay no attention to the essence of the concept of the nation which is a psychological attitude and is carved as a belief in minds of masses as the "myths of common ancestors" (Seyedimami, 1997).

In a multi-national and multi-ethnic country, dominance of the ethnic components of the ruling group (e.g. language, religion, customs, historical background) creates challenges to other ethnic groups (Arslan & Yigit, 2016; Byker & Marquardt, 2016; Kaya & Aydin, 2014; Yigit, 2018; Yigit & Tarman, 2016). Therefore, in such a situation, the ethnic groups that are deprived and restricted from expanding their culture, value, and community would be dissatisfied with the government and ruling group, hidden and evident. In this situation, countries such as the former Soviet Union, Georgia, and Turkey can be given as examples. A study indicated that the most powerful and strongest motive in the former Soviet Union, which caused ethnic crises, was usage of privileged social situations and opportunities by dominated members of the ethnic groups (Salehi Amiri, 2009). Since 1988, Georgia has also witnessed two violent ethnic conflicts and also a two-stage short-term civil war, the former was due to the aggressive spirit of Georgian nationalism and dominated Georgian culture and values in Georgia and the latter was due to conflict between various political parties to take power in Georgia (Cordell & Wolfe, 2014). In Turkey, Kamal Atatürk suppressed all its religious and ethnic rival identities, while emphasizing nationalism (Edwards, 2003).

Turkish speakers reside in a vast territory of Iran, in the provinces of West Azarbaijan, East Azarbaijan, Ardebil, Zanjan (Salehi Amiri, 2009) Qazvin and expanded into Hamedan province and the west of Gilan. Furthermore, they have a large number of people in some cities of Iran in form of a social integration (Armand & Peisureh, 2016). According to Anthony Smith (2003) "The Turks have followed traces of their ancestors until the ages of Aghuzkhan in the Central Asian steppes" (p. 184). Dr. Navazeni, in an article quoted by Fazlullah Hamedani, Rashid al-Din, mentioned the Tatar and Mongol ethnicities descendants of the Turks (Navazeni, 2010). The word "Turk" and "Turkish" is a cultural and linguistic concept refers to someone whose mother tongue is Turkish and is familiar with the customs of his people (Aydin & Ozfidan, 2014; Kaya, 2015; Hey'at, 2001). "Today, current language of the Azerbaijani people is Turkish, and it is called wrongly as 'Azari Turkish'. Azari language is among Iranian languages and has no kinship in Turkish; Azerbaijani Turks speak Turkish which is a branch of the Uralic-Altaic languages" (Salehi Amiri, 2009: p. 259).

Estimating the Turkish speakers' population is not easy, because they are dispersed across Iran, unlike other ethnic groups (Ahmadi, 2016). On the other hand, because in national censuses they are not registered as ethnic groups, it is difficult to estimate exact population of ethnic groups in Iran (Weeks, 2004). Researches show that between 35% to 45% of Iran's population are Turkish speakers (Forumtr, 2018; Koknar, 2006; Sahit, 2017). In the book "Borders and Brotherhood", Shaffer writes: "Nearly 27 million of Iran's 70 million population are Azerbaijanis" (Shaffer, 2006). Also, in an article it is Based on these estimates, some 25 million Azerbaijani Turks live in Iranian or Southern Azerbaijan, making them the largest ethnic group in the country (Jannatoglu, 2016). Abutalebi (2009) in the article "Ethnic Minorities and Convergence", states that the population of the Turkish speakers is 24-25%.

In an article, Mohsenianrad (2003) estimates the population of Turkish speakers in Iran between 20 and 25 percent. According to the World Ethnologue Website (2016): "According to my 2016 statistics one quarter of Iran's population is Azerbaijani Turks and this is apart from other Turkish speakers of Iran such as Turkmen and Qashqai."

Turkish speakers of Azerbaijan are one of the most important and largest ethnic groups in Iran which were undisputed ruler of Iran throughout several dynasties including Safavid, Afsharian and Qajar dynasties, which held over 365 years of state affairs. During the Qajar rule, Azerbaijan became residence of the crown prince and Tabriz became the largest commercial capital of Iran on trade with Russia and Europe (Shaffer, 2006). At this time, due to the wars of Iran and Russia, the Iranian government has lost parts of its territory according to the Golestan and Turkmenchai treaties and from then on, Azerbaijan was divided into two different parts (Devlet, 2012).

The Azerbaijani Turks were the pioneer of the Constitutional Revolution of Iran in 1906; calling for a limitation of the tyranny of the Qajars and the influence of foreigners in Iran (Weeks, 2004). During

the coup of Mohammad Shah and the time full of war and famine, the role of Azerbaijan was so effective that from the perspective of many Iranians, Azerbaijan is known as the center that any political transformation will be rooted from (Atabaki, 1997).

The Occurrence of the October Revolution of 1917 in Russia was important to encourage local insurgents in Iran (Nassibu, 2012). In this regard, Sheikh Mohammad Khaybani on July, 22, 1920 issued a resolution to form the government in Azerbaijan and Azerbaijan was renamed "Freedom State" (Maghsoodi, 2002, p. 244). "Azerbaijan has always been the heart of the liberation movements in Iran and Freedom State was the first step was to expand freedom throughout Iran" (Azari, 1974, p. 157).

During the Pahlavi regime in Iran, this regime defined the Iranian identity as "Persians" and demanded the Persianization of ethnic groups (Shaffer, 2006). According to John Foran (2011, p. 409) "In the budget of 1944-45, the amount that was considered for Tehran was 20 times the amount set for Azerbaijan, while Azerbaijan has tripled the size of Tehran." Iranian officials worried about the nationalism of Azerbaijani people residents in the northwest of Iran (Nuriyev, 2012).

Therefore, over time, Azerbaijani people understood that not only they will not be important, but they are also taken of their past and their dignity (Maghsoodi, 2002). In this regard, Jafar Pishevari came to Tabriz after rejection of his credentials in parliament and mentioned the basis of the Democratic Party of Azerbaijan and issued statement of the Democratic Party of Azerbaijan on 12th of September, (September 1945) (Atabaki, 1997). In the statement on the formation of State Associations, using Turkish language in local schools and government departments, and spending tax revenues for the development of the region were emphasized (Abrahamian, 2005).

During the 1960s and 1970s; economic and social plans of Shah's regime has increased the gap between the Persians and other ethnic groups (Shaffer, 2006). After the collapse of the Pahlavi regime, new government policies were in contrast to the demands of the Azerbaijani people. These differences led to the rise of chaos in December 1979 in Tabriz. (Weeks, 2004). After the end of the war, intellectuals and ethnic activists started their activity again due to non-compliance with the rights of the ethnic groups (Rashedi, 2007). In this era, after the Soviet dissolution, the nationalists of Turkey and the Republic of Azerbaijan encouraged nationalist movements in Iran in Azerbaijan (Maghsoodi, 2002).

One of the important and influential variables in the ethnic communities of the country is approaches and methods of government in setting up its interactions with ethnic groups and policies and procedures which governs these interactions. In current situation, some limitations in society for the Turkish speakers posed challenges in the country. Among these challenges are offenses and insults from the official and national media of the country against the ethnic groups. One of the most prominent examples of this insults to Turkish speakers occurred in 2006 by the controversial caricature of the Islamic Republic of Iran Weekly (Panahi, 2007). and another was "Fitileh Program" broadcasted from Channel 2 of Islamic Republic of Iran in 2015, which made Azerbaijan and Tehran face crisis for several months.

On the other hand, some experts and thinkers mention that ethnic issues and challenges in Azerbaijan, Iran is due to the neighboring countries of Azerbaijan and Turkey, because there are many commonalities in language, culture of the Turkish speakers of Iran with the people of these countries and this affects the formation of ethnic challenges in Iran. In this regard, adjacent countries may affect this side of the boundary due to ties with the ethnic groups in the country and using various tools and methods. This is done directly or indirectly or knowingly and unknowingly about and leads to formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan, Iran.

In this study, we are looking for explaining and describing this important and significant topic, and to a large extent, the grounds for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan have the internal and external roots. Many cultural grounds of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan provide the ground that neighboring countries use for their own purposes and interests and for exacerbating ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan. Therefore, this study tried to analyze cultural foundations influencing formation and the growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan, Iran, while identifying the factors that damage national solidarity and provide strategies for interaction of ethnicities in society and to increase national convergence in the country. Therefore, the main question of this study is: "What is the most important cultural ground affecting the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan?"

## **Theoretical Framework**

### **Ethnicity in search of government by Roland Breton**

The first stage of the ethnic dynamism is that the ethnic group be formed as a recognized real group, that is, a real community, which is aware of its existence, and emerges from nonexistence to existence. A significant difference between the number of existing human groups and the number of states

suggests that the vast majority of the nations in the present world have no government that they can associate with. This difference between the number of entities in the ethnic conformation system and the same number in the system of state conformation in today's world is declining due to two opposing processes: The first process is the tendency to increase the emerging languages which governments institutionalize them, and the second process is the tendency to eliminate other languages which could not be institutionalized (Alogali, 2018; Breton, 2015).

From the point of view of the ethnic groups, the institutionalization of some emerging languages means to recognize languages and their cultures inside a government with complex, federal or non-federal system. But this process of increasing freedom, which occurs in order to make more varieties in possible cultural applications as in governmental and sub-governmental structures, is being neutralized by another process. Because universal extension of compulsory education and cultural standardization in the media leads to a competition between the so-called cultural languages, from one hand, and mother-tongue dialects that remain in their own, on the other hand. A competition in which many dialects of the latter group disappear only during a few generations; Therefore, at the same time, as a group of languages activated in writing through institutionalization, other languages remaining in oral stage are disappeared due to lack of motivation. The decline of languages is exacerbated due to inequality competition between homeland dialects, on the one hand, and language of school, government, media, street and the language required for social upgrading, on the other hand (Breton, 2015).

Therefore, for any ethnicity that wants to express its identity, one of the first tasks is to establish unity in language. This is essential not only for the characterization of the ethnic group, but it is considered as an existential necessity for its geographical and human extensions. Hence, if the inconsistency or lack of a territorial base are the main obstacles in formation of a state or a subordinate state, lack of linguistic identity or linguistic cohesion can be big problems in this regard. It is in such a viewpoint that all ethnic movements put their emphasis on the need to protect threatened languages, creating unity of language in the absence of such unity, setting common standards, and finally, the spread of language in all parts of the population (Breton, 2015).

### **Research Questions**

In this research study, my primary research question is: What is the most important cultural contexts affecting the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan? I also explored the following sub questions:

1. How can cultural, social and religious aggression affect the ethnic groups as a platform for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan?
2. How can the proximity of Azerbaijani people's culture and language to the people of the Azerbaijan Republic and Turkey be the basis for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan?

### **Methodology**

The method used in this research is qualitative method. A qualitative research is meant to provide any kind of research that produces findings that have been achieved in ways other than quantitative methods. A qualitative case study 'can be defined as an intensive, holistic description and analysis of a single entity, phenomenon or social unit. Case studies are particularistic, descriptive and heuristic, and rely heavily on inductive reasoning in handling multiple data sources' (Rubin, 2018). At present, qualitative research methods in humanities research are more important than other methods in some complex subjects, including ethnic challenges. One of the most important techniques used in the qualitative method is deep interview technique that is used to collect data and information. In depth interview there are no specific questions and due to the lack of structure and flexibility, it is expected that the interviewer will develop questions when they are needed and appropriate for the interview situation (Elo & Kings, 2007). Given that in qualitative method, Achieving reliability and Validity, is not like quantitative methods. However, designed questions were reviewed by a few experts, and after being assured that the interview questions had validity and reliability, the deep interviewing phase was carried out. The content analysis method examines the explicit content of messages in a text. In this way, obvious content and messages are systematically described. Therefore, this method can be considered as a method for converting qualitative data into quantitative data (Zhang & Wildemuth, 2016).

Typically, qualitative studies use a form of non-random sampling; Such as accidental sampling, purpose, snowball and the like. In this regard, a purposeful sampling is used in this research. In purposeful sampling method, the researcher chooses, based on his own judgment, the subjects that are suitable for

research. For example, in a study to check the shortcomings and social, political, cultural and economic shortcomings of an ethnic groups in a community, the researcher decides to select members of his or her community from among the political activists of the ethnic group. From the viewpoint of the researcher, these individuals provide more useful and reliable information for research (Sanjabi, 2014).

In this study, the author tried to investigate the cultural grounds that influences formation and the growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan through in-depth interviews with experts and activists in this area. In this regard, using Judgment sampling method and according to the research topic, activists, professors, and experts from the field of study of ethnic challenges were selected and after conducting interviews with 32 experts using an in-depth interview, data saturation obtained and the interview ended. After accessing all the results obtained, analysis of interview data and quantitative content analysis performed in form of whole counting for all the results obtained from the in-depth interview.

## Findings

### 1. What are the main factors in the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan?

Table 1.

*Frequency and percent Distribution of the Most Important Cultural Platforms Ethnic Challenges in Azerbaijan in Experts' Views*

<u>Case</u>	<u>Frequency</u>	<u>percent</u>
Emphasis on a country's language and cultural discrimination, and the non-implementation of Article 15 of the Constitution for Turkish	49	39
Distorting history, Humorous jokes and myths , changing names, buildings and ... in Iran's Azerbaijan and there are not any books and publications and ... in Turkish	17	13/5
Increasing literacy, the advancement of communications technology and the Extend of cyberspace and The growth of Turkic speaking knowledge	16	12/5
The greater percentage of Provincial Radio and Television Network Programs are in Persian, and the destruction of Turkish language.	15	12
Aggression and cultural humiliation of Turkic speakers through the media	13	10/5
The impact of culture, language, media and progress of the Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey, and the strengthening of the Turkish identity in Azerbaijan, Iran	10	8
The feeling of being a second-degree citizen among the Turkic language people	4	3
Government inability to use Azerbaijan's touristic attractions	2	1/5
Total	126	100

**Note.** According to the findings of Table 1, the most important cultural context of the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan is the emphasis on a national language and cultural discrimination and the non-implementation of Article 15 of the Constitution for Turkish speakers, which is believed by 39% of experts. This is the most important factor. Also, 13.5% of the experts distorted the history, humiliated the myths and changed the names, buildings and ... Azerbaijan, and the lack of printing of books and magazines ... in Turkish and 12.5% of literacy experts, the advancement of communication technology and the expansion of cyberspace And the growth of Turkic-speaking consciousness from other cultural backgrounds has been the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan.

### 2. What role does the Republic of Azerbaijan play in shaping the growth and development of ethnic challenges in Iran's Azerbaijan?

Table 2.

*Frequency and percent distribution of the Republic of Azerbaijan's role in establishing the ethnic*

*challenges in Azerbaijan in terms of experts*

<u>Case</u>	<u>frequency</u>	<u>percent</u>
The existence of the Azerbaijan Republic with a superior Turkish identity in the Azerbaijani neighborhood of Iran with identity, culture, language and common history	23	31
Progress and development of the Republic of Azerbaijan Against the backwardness of Iran's Azerbaijan	20	27
The use of Iranian Turks from the Azerbaijan's media and template from them	13	17.5
Economic and tourist travel of Iranian Turks to Azerbaijan and comparison with them	12	16.5
The Qarabagh issue and Iran's apparent and secret support of Armenia	6	8
Total	74	100

**Note.** According to the findings of Table 2, the existence of the Republic of Azerbaijan with a superior Turkish identity in the Azerbaijani neighborhood of Iran in terms of identity, culture, language, etc. is one of the most important grounds for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan, with 31% of experts This is confirmed. Also, the development and development of the Republic of Azerbaijan against the backwardness of Azerbaijan in Azerbaijan and the high use of Turkmen language from the Azerbaijani media and their modeling, respectively, with 27 and 17.5 percent, respectively, played the most role in the formation and growth of ethnic challenges In Iran's Azerbaijan.

3. What role does Turkey play in shaping the growth and development of ethnic challenges in Iran?

Table 3.

*Frequency and Percent Distribution of the Role of Turkey in Setting Up for Ethnic Challenges in Iran's Azerbaijan by Experts*

<u>Case</u>	<u>frequency</u>	<u>percent</u>
Turkish satellite networks which affect Iran's Azerbaijan people	22	32
Progress and development of Turkey Against the backwardness of Iran's Azerbaijan	17	24.5
The cultural, historical and linguistic Proximity between the Turks of Iran's Azerbaijan with Turkey	13	19
Economic, cultural and tourist travel of Iranian Turks to Turkey and comparison with them	11	16
Turkey's united Turkish politics and the attract the Turks of other countries	6	8.5
Total	69	100

**Note.** According to the findings of Table 3, Turkish satellite networks and the great acceptance of Turkic speakers and their modeling are the most important basis for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan, with 32% of experts confirming this issue. They do. Also, the development and development of Turkey against the backwardness of Azerbaijan in Iran with 24.5% and the cultural and linguistic relationship ... Azerbaijan with Iran with 19% played the most role in the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan.

**General analysis of research findings**

1. According to the findings of Table 1, the most important cultural grounds in formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan were the emphasis on the language of a country, cultural discrimination, and the non-implementation of Article 15 of the Constitution for the Iranian Turkish

language speakers. 39% of experts believe that this is the most important factor. According to Asgharzadeh (2007), a researcher in the field of ethnicity, "lack of paying attention to a reality called ethnic identity and sacrificing effective manifestations of it for the national affiliation is the root of the ethnic crisis" (p. 98). At the time of Pahlavi's reign, Azerbaijani people witnessed intense cultural repression and widespread discrimination. Reza Shah established his claimed national rule based on culture, language and ethnicity of Persians and any language and culture other than Persian language and culture was destroyed (Shaffer, 2006). Reformed education in Reza Shah's reign, led Persian-only education in schools. Thus, Persian became the official language of education in the country and teaching in ethnic and local languages, the publication of books and newspapers was prohibited in non-Persian language (Atabaki, 1997).

Reza Baraheni writes about the Turkish-language suppression by the Pahlavi regime: "Azerbaijanis cannot study in their mother tongue and even write on the tombstone in native language; Also, students are fined and punished in schools for the use of native language" (Shaffer, 2006, p. 90). After the revolution of 1978, the idea of replicating Pahlavi thought continued to exist and obvious manifestations of discrimination and ethnic inequality dominated in the country, and then national and ethnic minority groups were in bad condition (Keddie, 2014). "While the constitution of the Islamic Republic of Iran guarantees equal equity for ethnic minorities such as the right to use local languages, these rights have been practically weakly implemented and have dissected the majority of ethnicities" (Keddie, 2014, p. 134).

2. Distorting history, humiliation of figures and myths, changing names and buildings of Azerbaijan and non-publication of books and magazines in Turkish were another cultural ground in formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan and 13.5% of experts acknowledged this. During the reign of the Pahlavi kings, denial of Azerbaijani language, insulting it, preventing the publication of the book, poetry, folklore and such policies caused discordance and hatred of the people (Jami, 2006). Contemporary Intellectual, Jalal Al-Ahmad describes the distortion and humiliation of Turkish speakers by the Pahlavis as: "It has been forty years that the whole effort of the government was not only limiting but also fading the Turkish language. They called it Azari, they called it imposed language, changed the name of the cities and neighborhoods in Azerbaijan, sent the Turkish employees and soldiers to Persian speaking provinces and vice versa. But we still have not had the slightest success in eliminating Turkish language" (Ale Ahmad, 1978, p. 138).

After the revolution, in the shadows of the open space created for the publication of books and magazines, a large number of newspapers, magazines and books were translated into Turkish (Morshedizadeh, 2004). This situation did not last long and the ethnic groups were again restricted. Many Azerbaijanis thought that democracy resulting from the revolution put an end to their restrictions on language and culture, but the failure of the revolution in establishing democracy, some Azerbaijani people were attracted to ethnic orientations (Shaffer, 2006).

3. Increase in literacy, advancement of communication technology, expanding cyberspace, and the growth of Turkish-speaking consciousness are another cultural grounds for ethnic challenges of Azerbaijan in Iran and 12.5% of experts have confirmed this issue. At the time of Pahlavi's rule, the famous motto of "God, the King, and the homeland" which was considered by Pahlavi dynasty as a manifestation of Iran's loyalty to the Shah, there was little room for the concept of "sovereignty of the nation" (Ashraf, 2016, p.213). But during the 1970s, technological and communications advances led to the strengthening a separate ethnic identity and along with industrialization and nomadic settlement were two contradictory conclusions: in central provinces, the people of the villages left the traditional fanaticism and strengthened their relations with the cities and the central government. In the marginal provinces, the ethnic origin formed a common identity which was based on individual language and culture (Abrahamian, 2005).

At the moment, the process of globalization has made many significant changes in breaking the ability and the monopoly of governments. One of its consequences is seeking cultural identities against the traditional mechanism of government (Maghsoodi, 2001). Ethnic-cultural awareness is a part of information intelligence which will strengthen the centrifugal forces. The expansion of communication has increased the cultural awareness of ethnic groups, familiarity with inter-ethnic differences, and conflicts. When the central government wants to expand its cultural influence in ethnic areas, the hostile reaction of ethnic minorities begins (Seyyedemami, 1997).

4. A greater percentage of provincial radio and television channels being Persian and the destruction of Turkish language are other cultural areas in ethnic challenges of Azerbaijan in Iran and 12% of experts believe in these issues. Pahlavi government dictating the policy of cultural unification, tried to melt millions of non-Persian speakers in the boiling pot of de-identification and turned them into an entity with cultural, identity and language characteristics acceptable to the courtiers of the Pahlavi (Asghari,

2015). Until the 1970s, having single voice was commonplace in the field of culture and communication and governments were the main entities which set the scene in this area. They were on the path of permanent and long-lasting basis in the field of deepening their influence and authority within the boundaries of national borders through the pursuit of the same cultural patterns. Implementation of the integrated education system, linguistic unification, unreal history making, historical magnificence, mythopoeticizing, national genealogy with old origins and with racial, ethnic, civilization magnificence and monopolization of the media, in particular in radio and television, removing and isolating minor identity-seeking, and imposing the cultural values of the ruling political and ideological system (Maghsoodi, 2002).

After the Revolution, however, some in the central government were still afraid that greater freedom of ethnicity in uncontrolled use of local languages may strengthen the links of these groups with their ethnic groups across the border and encourage separatism. However, Islamic Republic of Iran Broadcasting established Provincial Television and Radio Television Channels in the Azerbaijani Provinces of Iran which have programs in Azerbaijani Turkish and the other language minorities. But their quality and quantity are inappropriate and ethnic groups tend to have more independent local television channels and the local press (Keddie, 2014).

5. Cultural abusing and humiliation of Turkish speaking people through the media was another cultural ground in formation of ethnic challenge of Azerbaijan in Iran. 10.5% of experts believe in this issue. During the Pahlavi reign, the lack of any local self-government, the humiliating position of Pahlavi kings against linguistic minorities, and their counter-religion policies as a particular factor in the escalation of discontent (Faust, 1995). After the revolution sensation literature about racial and ethnic equality mentioned in limited space. Thus, following the Pahlavi regime's policies, the Persian language, which was only the native language of Iran's Persian ethnicity promoted into the position of "national language of all Iranians", the result of which was more isolation and humiliation of non-Persian languages and cultures of nationalities such as Turks, Balochs, Arabs, and Turkmen (Asgharzadeh, 2007).

6. Impact of culture, language, media, the progress of the Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey and strengthening the Turkish identity in Azerbaijan are other cultural grounds for ethnic challenges. From a historical and ethnic perspective, Turkey has close ties with the Republic of Azerbaijan and is considered to be the closest and most important ally of the Azerbaijani Republic (Souleimanov, Pikal, & Kaus 2013). According to the interviewees, while this factor in internal area of cultural ground is one of the grounds of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan of Iran with 8%, but in the foreign sphere, the existence of the Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey with the superior Turkish identity in the neighborhood of Azerbaijan and with common identity, culture, and language is among the most important basis for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan. 31% of experts confirmed this in relation to the Republic of Azerbaijan and 19% confirmed it in the case of Turkey. The superiority and supremacy of native Turkish-speaking identities in Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey is a source of interest and attraction for Iranian Turkish speakers, whose identity is secondary and subordinate (Vahedi, 2007). Development and advancement of the Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey in terms of economic, the tourism industry and so on, and in opposite, Azerbaijan's retardation in Iran is another area of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan, Iran. 27 percent of experts admitted this issue in relation to Republic of Azerbaijan and 24% confirmed it in the case of Turkey. Recent Developments in Turkey and Republic of Azerbaijan in various aspects led to a positive opinion in Azerbaijan Provinces towards these countries.

Excessive use of Azerbaijani and Turkish media by Turkish speakers in Iran, particularly their satellite television channels, is indirectly effective in forming the ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan of Iran. 32% and 17.5% of experts confirmed this for Turkey and Republic of Azerbaijan, respectively. In 2006, the US government had requested \$ 75 million from Congress to promote democracy in Iran, with about half of that spent on human rights groups and Gonaz Tv's Turkic language network in Chicago and Baku (Khalaji, 2007). Gonaz TV is a 24-hour satellite channel to Azerbaijani Turkish language in Chicago and Baku which providing programs for Turkish language people in Iran (Tohidi, 2006).

On the other hand, Scarlett Ritter, a former Navy intelligence officer, says "Azerbaijan Republic is of great importance to US interests. Why?; Because, the neighbor is Iran and the closest way to reach the city of Tehran; located below the southern coast of the Caspian Sea" (Plesch & Butcher, 2007, p. 28). Based on such analyzes, the American effort to expand its military presence in the Republic of Azerbaijan and strengthen military ties with the country are meaningful (Bradley, 2006). In this regard, The Pentagon has secret relations with ethnic groups such as Turks, Kurds and Balochs and encouraged them to step up efforts to undermine the authority of the Iranian government in the northern regions (Hersh, 2006). This is while McFaul, Milani and Diamond (2006) say in an article that American support for ethnicity in Iran is



causing the Iranian people to hate the United States. The people which United States are trying to attract them to deal with the Iranian regime.

Given the diversity of media, audiences have different tendencies and motivations for selection of media types and their programs and thought, desires, culture, and especially language have a great influence on the selection of programs (Sepehri, 2007). Due to their effective role in shaping public opinion, Turkish and Azerbaijani media are considered as a means in their hands because of our fault and inability to use it as a very important tool and they use it for their own purposes (Vahedi, 2007).

Economic and tourism travel of Iranian Turkish-speaking people to Turkey and Republic of Azerbaijan and comparing themselves with them can be another area for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan. 16.5% and 16% believe in this issue regarding the Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey, respectively. Turkey and Republic of Azerbaijan are the annual destination of thousands of passengers from the Azerbaijani region of Iran. On these trips, Iranian people find cultural and linguistic proximity and they ask themselves why in the countries with the same language and culture as ours, people have a lot of prosperity, work less, and their days are passed like fun, why we are not like them. These questions have a profound effect on the minds of the Turkish-speaking people of Azerbaijan.

Politics of Unified Turkish Ummah and attraction of the Turks of other countries with 8.5% and the Qarabagh issue and the overt and covert support of Iran from Armenia with 8%, are other areas of the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan. Regarding Iran's ambiguous policies on the issue of Qarabagh, the Turkish speakers say that the Iranian government protects Palestinian for being Muslims. but when the Qarabagh issue arose, not only Iran did defend it, but in the war of a Muslim country with an Armenian country, it supported the Armenians, who have long been considered infidels. According to Shaffer, the Azerbaijani people are focused on the border of Iran, which ties with the people of their neighboring countries. In addition, the Turks in the other countries are in the majority, and this factor has a significant impact on the bilateral relations of Iran with its neighbors (Shaffer, 2006). And as Held points out, globalization is the establishment of links and interconnections between societies and undoubtedly, culture is the most important component of globalization; Because culture is the most central link between nations and places (Held, 2004).

7. Turkish speakers of Iran feeling they are second-degree citizens is another cultural area for the ethnic challenges of Azerbaijan and 3% of experts believe in this issue. With the advent of Reza Khan, humiliation of language and culture of other ethnic groups, in particular, the uncontested Turkish majority, started with the ugliest method possible (Sadeghi, 2007). Therefore, there were two distinct feeling of superiority and inferiority between Persian and non-Persian speakers in Iran. A phenomenon increased the superiority of the Persian speaking people and feeling of discrimination and repression in other ethnic groups and led to the formation and growth of identity-seeking nationalist sentiment as a force against the capital's de-identification deployed in ethnic areas such as Azerbaijan (Asghari, 2015). 8. 1.5% of experts believe that inability of the Government to use Azerbaijan's tourist attractions and attracting tourists are other cultural issues in formation of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan. Today, many of the world's touristic countries are multi-ethnic and multi-language tourism destinations and this is one of the reasons why tourists are attracted to these countries. But our country has by no means been able to use this opportunity that many of the northern Turkish speaking cities provide with their own customs and traditions.

## **Discussion and Conclusion**

The fundamental difference between the present research and other research that has been done so far on the ethnic challenges is that by examining a large number of previous research on ethnic challenges, it is concluded that previous research can be divided into two groups in the main. The first group is research that only explores the external factors and roots that have an impact on ethnic challenges, and the second group is research that only explores one or two aspects of the internal factors that affect the formation of ethnic challenges. But in this research has tried the most important substrate for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan Iran is carefully investigated and analyzed. To put this research together with other researches simultaneously, we analyze the internal and external aspects of the ethnic challenges of Azerbaijan in Iran.

This research, while to review other research on the formation and growth of ethnic challenges, tried to In addition to the internal context the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan pay attention to the external substrate. Although this topic has been considered in some sources in the historical periods before the Islamic Revolution, but this research has tried to study these substrates in the Islamic Republic and so far. In this regard, in this research, we sought to explain and comment on this important issue, which is the underlying cause of a large part of the formation and growth of the ethnic challenges of

the internal and external origins. So that many Substrates of the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan Iran provides an excuse for foreign countries So that they use these Substrates in their country's policies and interests to create Crises and ethnics challenges in Azerbaijan Iran. Perhaps, if these substrates were not, foreign countries could not exploit the potential of ethnic groups in Iran. And if foreign countries were not exploiting this potential of ethnic groups in Iran, perhaps we never witnessed ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan and the issues and demands of the peoples were resolved peacefully.

In an ethnically diverse community, concentration and emphasis on the domination of a culture, the subsequent pursuit of cultural discrimination against other ethnic groups, and lack of rules or non-enforcement of laws in which rights of the ethnic groups are included, all can create challenges in society. As it is clear from the results of this study, emphasis on the singularity of the language in the country, cultural discrimination, and the non-implementation of Article 15 of the Constitution for the Turkish speakers were among the most important grounds for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan. 39% of experts have confirmed these issues. According to Breton's theory, extended compulsory education and cultural unification with different tools and methods, especially in the media, create a competition between the official and dominant languages on the one hand, and native languages, which are left in themselves, on the other hand. The result of this unequal competition is the loss of mother tongues only in a few generations.

During the reign of Reza Shah, only Persian language was taught in schools and teaching other languages of the ethnic groups, especially Turkish language, was forbidden in Azerbaijan. This policy continued during the Islamic Republic and to this day Azerbaijani students are deprived of instruction in Turkish. From experts' point of view, limitation and prohibition of teaching in Turkish in Iran, especially in Azerbaijan, leads Turkish language to be weakened and faded every day. According to Breton, the disappearance of languages is due to inequal competition that exists and is intensified between mother tongues which are spoken orally and are not written, and the official language of writing, school, government, and media.

According to experts, whenever measures are taken against culture and language of Turks in the country, Azerbaijanis have reacted. because people feel and understand cultural discrimination better. For Breton, all ethnic movements have their emphasis on protecting threatened languages, creating unity of common language and standards, and finally, spread of language to all parts of the nation. In this regard, the caricature of Iran Newspaper in 2006 and the issue of "Fitileh Program" in 2015, which both were cultural issues, and they both humiliated and mocked the identities and languages of the people of Azerbaijan, made the Turkish speakers react intensively and they came to the streets to protect their language and culture. The result of this was several months of protest and challenging sovereignty and the rule.

According to the interviewees, cultural, linguistic, historical of Iranian Azerbaijanis with Republic of Azerbaijan with 31% and Turkey with 19% and the superiority of the Turkish identity in these countries and lack of Turkish identity in Iran, and also, the development and advancement of the Republic of Azerbaijan with 27% and Turkey with 24.5% were the most important areas for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan. Therefore, development and advancement of these countries and their people's pride in Turkish culture and language versus backwardness, deprivation, and limitation of Turkish Speakers in Iran, applying a variety of discrimination and insults to them, the growing sense of second and third degree citizen in the country for being Turk, and factors of this type, all raise this question in the minds of the Turkish speakers of Azerbaijan that how the Azerbaijani Republic established a government for itself with about 10 million people and makes progress day by day, but we have more than 30 million people in Iran and still face discrimination, humiliation and distortion and moving backward? Therefore, the comparison that Iranian Turkish speakers make with people of the Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey leads to their divergence and the formation of ethnic challenges.

Azerbaijani and Turkish media, especially the satellite channels of these countries, that broadcast in Turkish attract Turkish speakers of Azerbaijan in Iran who like to see their programs in their native language. According to the result of the current study, Turkish satellite channels with 32% and Azerbaijan's channels with 17.5% are influencing the ethnic challenges of Iran in Azerbaijan. On the other hand, apart from the fact that their programs are Turkish, which is an important factor in attracting Iranian Turkish-speaking audiences of Azerbaijan, it is variety and cheerfulness of the programs that will increase the attraction of the audiences. These factors show themselves more when all programs in Iran are broadcasted in Persian, while it is the official language of country, but it is not the native language of Turks in Iran. On the other hand, there is no factor called diversity and happiness in most programs. Therefore, the modern world, the rule of the media, and the easy access of citizens to information, all led to the fact that more

powerful persons take control of the public minds. In this regard, the literary and cultural movement of Azerbaijan in Iran is like a thirsty tree that absorbs every moisture and media of Turkey and Republic of Azerbaijan use this opportunity in the best way possible.

According on the above, it is indicated that a large part of the cultural grounds for the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan of Iran has internal and external roots. This in such a way that on the one hand, many cultural grounds of the ethnic challenges of Azerbaijan in Iran have been created throughout history in Iran, continued so far and are going on be exacerbated and the Iranian authorities have not paid attention to it and have not taken actions regarding them. On the other hand, cultural and linguistic commonalities of Turkish speakers of Iran with those of Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey create situations in which these countries use various tools and methods the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan in the direction of the policies and interests of their own country directly or indirectly and knowingly or unknowingly.

Therefore, if there were no domestic cultural grounds for ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan, Republic of Azerbaijan and Turkey could not have an effect on the formation and growth of ethnic challenges in Azerbaijan. According to Keddie (2014), although the Iranian government has serious concerns regarding the exploitation of dissatisfaction of Azerbaijani people by foreigners, but its fault in advancing plans in order to eliminate the cultural and economic discontent of minorities can only add to this discontent. For example, if the identity and language of Turkish speakers are recognized in Iran and Turkish speakers can study in Turkish in schools and universities and through this see their identity and language as respected and superior, their convergence with the country will increase or if the Turkish speakers in Iran have independent and powerful media and can publish their culture and values, they no longer need to use media from neighboring countries and thus they are not influenced by them. Also, if Iran's Azerbaijan was more developed and more advanced, the Turkish speakers of these provinces would see themselves superior while comparing themselves with the peoples of the neighboring countries, and therefore, their belonging to the country would increase.

All in all, it can be concluded that when the values and cultural components of all ethnicities are considered in a multi-ethnicity country and ethnic groups can preserve their language and culture freely and without restrictions and coercion, there will be no basis for the formation of ethnic challenges and all the ethnic groups in that country try to enhance solidarity and national co-operation and the result is the convergence of ethnic groups with national identity and their divergence from neighboring countries.

## References

- Abrahamian, Y. (2005). *Iran Between Two Revolutions; An Introduction on Contemporary Iranian Sociology* (trans. Golmohammadi, A., & Fattahi, M. E.). Tehran, Iran: Ney Publication.
- Ahmadi, H. (2016). *Ethnic Groups and Ethnicity in Iran: Myth and Reality*. Tehran, Iran: Ney Publication.
- Ale Ahmad, J. (1978). *Regarding the Service and Betrayal of Intellectuals*. Tehran, Iran: Kharazmi Publishing House.
- Alogali, A. (2018). World Englishes: Changing the Paradigm of Linguistic Diversity in Global Academia. *Research In Social Sciences And Technology*, 3(1), 54-73. Retrieved from <http://ressat.org/index.php/ressat/article/view/342>
- Armand, F., & Peisureh, F. (2016). Investigating the Interaction and Solidarity of Iranian Ethnic Groups in the National Unity Dialogue. *Scientific Journal of Researches of Nations. First volume*, 1(4), 1-10
- Arslan, S. & Yigit, M. F. (2016). Investigation of the Impact of Emotional Intelligence Efficacy on Teachers' Multicultural Attitudes. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(11), 147-157.
- Asghari, R. (2015, January 6). *Necessity of Elimination of Ethnic Discrimination to Prevent Major Crises*. Retrieved from <http://www.Durnanews.ir>
- Asgharzadeh, A. (2007). *Iran and the Challenge of Diversity: Islamic Fundamentalism, Aryanism Racism, and Democratic Struggles*. London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ashraf, A (2004). *Identity, Nationality, Ethnicity*. Tehran, Iran: Institute for Human Sciences Research and Development.
- Ashraf, A. (2016). *Iranian Identity: From Ancient Times to the End of Pahlavi* (trans. Ahmadi, H.). Tehran, Iran: Ney Publication.
- Atabaki, T. (1997). *Azerbaijan in Contemporary Iran* (trans. Eshragh, M. K.). Tehran, Iran: Toos Publishing.
- Aydin, H., & Ozfidan, B. (2014). Perceptions on mother tongue (Kurdish) based multicultural and bilingual education in Turkey. *Multicultural Education Review*, 6(1), 51-79.
- Azari, A. (1974). *Sheikh Mohammad Kheyabani Uprising in Tabriz*. Tehran, Iran: Safi Alishah Press Office.

- Bashirieh, H. (2015). *A Preface on the Political Sociology of Iran in the Period of the Islamic Republic of Iran*. Tehran, Iran: Negah Moaser Institute.
- Bradley, J. R. (2006). Iran's Ethnic Tinderbox. *The Washington Quarterly* 30(1), 181-190. The MIT Press. Retrieved from <http://www.September 22, 2018, from Project MUSE database>
- Breton, R. (2015). *Political Ethnology* (trans. Fakouhi, N.). Tehran, Iran: Ney Publication.
- Byker, E. J., & Marquardt, S. K. (2016). Using critical cosmopolitanism to globally situate: Multicultural education in teacher preparation courses. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 7(2), 30-50.
- Cordell, K., & Wolfe, S. (2015). *Ethnic Conflicts* (trans. Ramezanzadeh, A.). Tehran, Iran: Mizan Cultural Science Publishing.
- Devlet, N. (2012, July 24). *Turkey and Greater Azerbaijan: A Card to Play*. Retrieved from <http://www.gmfus.org/publications/turkey-and-greater-azerbaijan-card-play>
- Edwards, B. M. (2003). *Politics and Government in the Middle East* (trans. Afzali, R.). Tehran, Iran: Bashir Cultural and Art Institute of Science and Technology.
- Faust, L. (1995). *Iran and the Cold War: The Crisis of Azerbaijan (1945-1946)* (trans. Bayat, K.). Tehran, Iran: Ministry of Foreign Affairs Publishing.
- Foran, J. (2011). *Fragile Resistance: History of Social Changes in Iran (from Safavids to the Years after the Islamic Revolution)* (trans. Tadayyon, A.). Tehran, Iran: Rasa Cultural Services Institute Publishing.
- Haywood, A. (2004). *An Introduction to Political Theory* (trans. Alem, A. R.). Tehran, Iran: Ghoms Publication.
- Held, D. (2004). *A globalizing world? Culture, economics and politics*. London and New York in Association with the Open University
- Hersh, S. (2006, November). *The Next Act, The New Yorker*. Retrieved from <http://webcache.googleusercontent.com>
- Hey'at, J. (2001). *Review of the History of Turkish Language and Dialects*. Tehran, Iran: Peykan Publishing House.
- Jami, N. (2006). *The Past is a Light for the Future: The History of Iran in the Interval between two Coups (1920-1953)*. Tehran, Iran: Ghoghnoos Publishing.
- Jannatoglu, A. (2016). The Minority Rights of Azerbaijani Turks in Iran. *Middle East Review of International Affairs*, 20(1), 8-13.
- Kaya, I., & Aydin, H. (2014). *Pluralism, multiculturalism and bilingual education [Çoğulculuk, Çokkültürlü ve İkidilli Eğitim]*. Ankara: Ani Press.
- Kaya, Y. (2015). The Opinions of Primary School, Turkish Language and Social Science Teachers regarding Education in the Mother Tongue (Kurdish). *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies*, 2(2), 33-46.
- Khalaji, M. (2007, July 9). *U.S. Support for the Iranian position*. Retrieved from <http://www.washingtoninstitute.org>
- Keddie, R. N. (2014). *Results of the Iranian Revolution* (trans. Haghightakhah, M.). Tehran, Iran: Ghoghnoos Publication.
- Koknar, A. M (2006, June 6). *Iranian Azeris: A Giant Minority*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/view/iranian-azeris-a-giant-minority>
- Maghsoodi, M. (2002). *Ethnic Changes in Iran; Causes and Backgrounds*. Tehran, Iran: Institute of National Studies Publishing.
- McFaul, M., Milani, A., & Diamond, L. (2006). Awin – Win U.S. Strategy for Dealing with Iran. *The Washington Quarterly*, 30(1), 121-138. <https://doi.org/10.1162/wash.2006-07.30.1.121>
- Mohsenianrad, M. (2003). The need for attention to the issue of intercultural communication in Iranian society. *Media Journal*, 14(1), 20-26
- Nassibu, N. (2012, August 28). Azerbaijan Iranian Relation: Past and Present. *Journal of Azerbaijan Studies*, Retrieved from <http://www.dspace.khazar.org/jspui/bitstream>
- Navazeni, B. (2010). The Tabaristan Pattern in the Russian Federation. *Central Asia and Caucasus Studies*, 3(72), 135-164.
- Nuriyev, E. (2012, June 14). *Azerbaijan: the Geopolitical Conundrum*. Retrieved from <http://www.opendemocracy.net/od-russia>
- Panahi, M. A. (2007). A look at the Phenomenon of Social Gaps in Iran and the Need to Pay Attention to Them. *Gunash Special Issue*, 5(40), 165-168.
- Plesch, D., & Butcher, M. (2007). Considering A War with Iran. *Centre for international studies and diplomacy*, 1-72, <https://eprints.soas.ac.uk>
- Rashedi, H. (2007). *Turks and Reviewing Their History, Language and Identity in Iran*. Tehran, Iran: Andishe Noo Publication.

- Rubin, D. I. (2018). The Muddy Waters of Multicultural Acceptance: A Qualitative Case Study on Antisemitism and the Israeli/Palestinian Conflict. *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies*, 5(1), 1-15
- Sadeghi, A. (2007). Autopsy of the Saga of the Nation of Azerbaijan. *Gunash Special Issue*, 5(40), 108-114
- Sahit, B. (2017, February 10). *Poupolation of turhs in Iran*. Retrieved from <http://www.tebaren.org/?p=732>
- Salehi Amiri, S. R. (2009). *Ethnic Dispute Management in Iran*. Tehran, Iran: Strategic Research Center Publishing.
- Sanjabi, A. (2014). *Methodology in Political Science and International Relations*. Tehran, Iran: Gomes Publishing.
- Sepehri, M. B. (2007). Investigation of Effective Factors on Ardabil Users of the Satellite Channels of Turkey and Azerbaijan. (Master's Thesis, Faculty of Radio and Television, Media Management), Tehran, Iran.
- Seyyedemami, K. (1997). Ethnic Nationalism: In search of Further Understanding. *Middle East Studies*, 3(10-11), 252-260.
- Shaffer, B. (2006). *Borders and Brotherhood and the Challenge of the Identity of Azerbaijan* (trans. Azar, Y. S.). Tehran, Iran: Ulus Publisher,
- Shaffer, B. (2006, June 2). *Iran's Volatile Ethnic Mix*. <https://www.nytimes.com/2006/06/02/opinion/02iht-edshaffer.1874687.html>
- Smith, A. D. (2003). Ethnic Challenges and the Retirement of Nations (trans. Mehraïn, M.). *Strategic studies*, 25(29), 182-204
- Smith, A. D. (2012). *Nationalism and Modernism: A Critical Examination of Recent National Theories and Nationalism* (trans. Firuzmand, K.). Tehran, Iran: Salis Publication.
- Souleimanov, E., Pikal, K., & Kraus, J. (2013). The Rise of Nationalism among Iranian Azerbaijanis: A Step Toward Iran's Disintegration? *Middle East Review of International Affairs*, 17(1), 71-91
- Tohidi, N. (2006, June 29). *Iran: Regionalism, ethnicity and democracy*. Retrieved from <http://www.openDemocracy.net>
- Vahedi, E. (2007). *Ethnic Identity in Azerbaijan*. Tehran, Iran: International Cultural Studies and Research Institute of Abrar Moaser.
- Weeks, R. (2004). *The Encyclopedia of Muslim Ethnic Groups* (trans. Ebrahimi, M., & Matin, P.). Tehran, Iran: Amir Kabir Publishing.
- Yigit, M. (2018). Does higher education change value perceptions?. *Journal of Culture and Values in Education*, 1(1), 1-8. Retrieved from <http://cultureandvalues.org/index.php/JCV/article/view/5>
- Yigit, M.F. and Tarman, B. (2016). How Do Different Ethnicities Approach to the Education System and Differences in Turkey? *Italian Sociological Review*, 6 (3), pp. 339-353
- Zhang, Y., & Wildemuth, B. M. (2016, April 27). *Qualitative analysis of content*. In Applications of Social Research Methods to Questions in Information and Library Science. Retrieved from <https://philpapers.org/rec/ZHAQAO>